When and why people think beliefs are “debunked” by scientific explanations of their origins
Dillon Plunkett, Lara Buchak and Tania Lombrozo

Is the folk concept of pain polyeidic?
Emma Borg, Richard Harrison, James Stazicker and Tim Salomons

Testing for the phenomenal: Intuition, metacognition, and philosophical methodology
Miguel Egler

Rational learners and metaethics: Universalism, relativism, and evidence from consensus
Alisabeth Ayars and Shaun Nichols

Smell’s puzzling discrepancy: Gifted discrimination, yet pitiful identification
Benjamin D. Young

How to do things with modals
Matthew Mandelkern
The phenomena of mind and language are currently studied by researchers in linguistics, philosophy, psychology, artificial intelligence, and cognitive anthropology and archaeology. Mind & Language aims to bring this work together in a genuinely interdisciplinary way.

Publisher: Mind & Language is published by John Wiley & Sons, 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ and 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148, USA.

Journal Customer Services: For ordering information, claims and any enquiry concerning your journal subscription please go to https://hub.wiley.com/community/support/onlinelibrary or contact your nearest office.

Americas: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +1 791 388 8598 or +1 800 835 6770 (toll free in the USA and Canada).

Europe, Middle East and Africa: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +44 (0) 1865 778315.

Asia Pacific: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +65 6511 8000.

Japan: For Japanese speaking support, Email: cs-japan@wiley.com.

Visit our Online Customer Help at https://hub.wiley.com/community/support/onlinelibrary

Production Editor: Sherry Ganace (mila@wiley.com)

Information for subscribers: Mind & Language is published in 5 issues per year. Institutional subscription prices for 2020 are: Print & Online: £1075 (UK), €1363 (Europe), $2193 (The Americas), $2560 (Rest of World).

Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST/HST and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/library-info/products/pricelists/payment. Prices include online access to the current and all online backfiles to January 1st, 2016, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/library-info/products/pricelists.

Terms of use can be found here: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/terms-and-conditions.

Delivery Terms and Legal Title: Where the subscription price includes print issues and delivery is to the recipient’s address, delivery terms are Delivered at Place (DAP); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Title to all issues transfers from the Publisher (or our agents) at the point of shipment. Where the subscription price includes online access, delivery terms are Delivered at Place (DAP); the recipient is responsible for ensuring that the recipient is able to receive the online content and that it is accessible to those for whom it is purchased. The recipient is responsible for paying any local taxes or duties.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/mila

Copyright and Copying (in any format): © 2020 John Wiley & Sons Ltd. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to copy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organisation (RRO), e.g. Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (www.copyright.com), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for republication, for creating new collective works or for resale. Permissions for such reuse can be obtained using the RightsLink “Request Permissions” link on Wiley Online Library. Special requests should be addressed to: permissions@wiley.com

Disclaimer: The Publisher and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher and Editors of the products advertised.

Abstracting and Indexing Services: The Journal is indexed by Academic Search (EBSCO Publishing); Academic Search Alumni Edition (EBSCO Publishing); Academic Search Premier (EBSCO Publishing); Arts & Humanities Citation Index (Clarivate Analytics); Communication & Mass Media Index (EBSCO Publishing); Current Contents: Social & Behavioral Sciences (Clarivate Analytics); IBR & IBZ: International Bibliographies of Periodical Literature (KG Saur); INSPEC (IET); Journal Citation Reports/JCR (Clarivate Analytics); MLA International Bibliography (MLA); Periodical Index Online (ProQuest); Philosopher’s Index (Philosopher’s Information Center); Philosophy Research Index (PDC); PhilPapers; PSYINDEX (ZPID); SCOPUS (Elsevier); Social Science Premium Collection (ProQuest); Social Sciences Citation Index (Clarivate Analytics).

Printed in Singapore by C.O.S. Printers Pvt Ltd.

ISSN 0268 1064 (Print)
ISSN 1468 0017 (Online)

Mind & Language accepts articles for Open Access publication. Please visit https://authorservices.wiley.com/author-resources/Journal-Authors/open-access/onlinopen.html for further information about OnlineOpen.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/mila

Wiley’s Corporate Citizenship initiative seeks to address the environmental, social, economic, and ethical challenges faced in our business and which are important to our diverse stakeholder groups. Since launching the initiative, we have focused on sharing our content with those in need, enhancing community philanthropy, reducing our carbon impact, creating a diverse and inclusive workplace, and engaging our colleagues and other stakeholders in our efforts. Follow our progress at www.wiley.com/go/citizenship.

Wiley is a founding member of the UN-backed HINARI, AGORA, and OARE initiatives. They are now collectively known as Research4Life, making online scientific content available free or at nominal cost to researchers in developing countries. Please visit Wiley’s Content Access – Corporate Citizenship site: http://www.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-390082.html.

Notes for Contributors

Mind & Language publishes original and accessible articles in linguistics, philosophy, psychology, artificial intelligence, and cognitive anthropology and archaeology. The Journal does not publish papers which are primarily devoted to the presentation of new empirical research. Manuscripts should be submitted for online manuscript submission and peer review through ScholarOne Manuscripts at https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/mila.

Information about preparation and submission of manuscripts is available at https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/page/journal/14680017/homepage/forauthors.html.

Each contributor will receive free access to his or her article via the ArticleShare function in their Author Services account. Additional offprints may be purchased from John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK.
Forthcoming

Understanding self-ascription
Frank Jackson and Daniel Stoljar

Slurs and register: A case study in meaning pluralism
Justina Diaz-Legaspe, Chang Liu and Robert J. Stainton

Water is and is not H₂O
Kevin P. Tobia, George E. Newman and Joshua Knobe

CURRENT DIRECTIONS ESSAY
New directions in predictive processing
Jakob Hohwy

MULTIPLE REVIEW OF Conjoining Meanings by Paul Pietroski

Conjoining meanings without losing our heads
John Collins

Whither extensions?
David Pereplyotchik

Truth is dead; long live the Truth. Commentary on Conjoining Meanings by Paul Pietroski
Gillian Ramchand

REPLY FROM THE AUTHOR
Responses to comments on Conjoining Meanings
Paul Pietroski
## Contents

*When and why people think beliefs are “debunked” by scientific explanations of their origins*
  Dillon Plunkett, Lara Buchak and Tania Lombrozo 3

*Is the folk concept of pain polyeidic?*
  Emma Borg, Richard Harrison, James Stazicker and Tim Salomons 29

*Testing for the phenomenal: Intuition, metacognition, and philosophical methodology*
  Miguel Egler 48

*Rational learners and metaethics: Universalism, relativism, and evidence from consensus*
  Alisabeth Ayars and Shaun Nichols 67

*Smell’s puzzling discrepancy: Gifted discrimination, yet pitiful identification*
  Benjamin D. Young 90

*How to do things with modals*
  Matthew Mandelkern 115